

Higher Education as Context for Music Pedagogy Research

Elin Angelo

Norwegian University of Science and Technology

Jens Knigge

Nord University

Morten Sæther

Queen Maud University College of Early Childhood Education

Wenche Waagen

Norwegian University of Science and Technology

Welcome to the anthology *Higher Education as Context for Music Pedagogy Research*.

This anthology is the second publication in the scholarly series *MusPed:Research* and concerns the field of higher education. The anthology consists of 14 chapters, arranged under the following themes: (i) instrumental music education, (ii) group-oriented and interdisciplinary music education, and (iii) critical examination of music teacher education programs. Before describing the specific chapters, we will first comment on the title of the anthology. These comments, divided into two parts, are contextually and linguistically oriented towards the growth and development of music educational disciplines in Scandinavian, German, and Anglo-American contexts. The first part is titled “Higher Education as Context” and concerns both higher music education and

Citation of this chapter: Angelo, E., Knigge, J., Sæther, M. & Waagen, W. (2021). Higher Education as Context for Music Pedagogy Research. In E. Angelo, J. Knigge, M. Sæther & W. Waagen (Eds.), *Higher Education as Context for Music Pedagogy Research* (pp. 7–17). Cappelen Damm Akademisk. <https://doi.org/10.23865/noasp.119.ch00>
License: CC BY-NC-ND 4.0.

music teacher education. The second part has the title “Music Pedagogy Research”, and builds on the perspectives of *Bildung* and *Didaktik* in German/Scandinavian fields within *Musikpädagogische Forschung/musikkpedagogisk forskning*.

Higher Education as Context

Higher music education is organized through a range of disciplines and educational programs and takes place at institutions such as music academies, universities, university colleges, and teacher education programs. In these contexts, music (as a subject in higher education) is focused and understood differently – for example, as performance music studies, as science-oriented studies, or as one of several issues for lifelong learning or community building. From this, there can be huge variations in norms and ways to assess quality, among the different educational- and research cultures. Some research and knowledge development are published as articles in international, peer-reviewed journals, while other research ends up in performance, with concerts, videos, and sound production. The series *MusPed:Research* is targeted toward the intersection between the many disciplines, educational contexts, and research traditions in the manifold field of music education. As a contribution to grasping the broad field of knowledge, expertise, and identities, a short description is provided of some of the main institutionalized divisions within the disciplines of higher music education.

Musikwissenschaft (Eng: musicology, No: *musikkvitenskap*) arose as an independent field of knowledge and research in Germany in the last part of the 19th century. An example is Adler’s seminal book from 1885, *Umfang, Methode und Ziel der Musikwissenschaft*. Originally, this knowledge field was focused on analyses and understandings of Western classical music. Today, this field includes a range of approaches and foci, for example ethnomusicology, popular musicology, early music performance, music psychology, music philosophy, and music history (Nettl, 2001; Ruud, 2016). Ruud (2016) also positioned the areas of music therapy, music sociology, and music education within the field of musicology, and hence placed context-oriented and practice-oriented approaches to music within the

musicological field of education and research. Context-oriented and relation-oriented approaches to music are also labeled as music anthropology (Blacking, 1976) and concern music not only as a “thing” but also as an activity or practice oriented toward nurturing relations and communities (Bartleet & Higgins, 2018; Elliot, 1995; Small, 1998), and are approaches that have influenced the wider field of music education research (DeNora, 2003; Wright, 2016). According to Nettl (2001), musicology is a field of knowledge “distinguished from other humanistic disciplines in its theoretical (if not always *de facto*) inclusion of all imaginable kinds of research into music” (p. 288), and he explains that similarly holistic disciplines in other arts, as for example “artology,” “dramatology,” and “literaturology” seems not to have been developed in North America (in 2001).¹ Today there exists a range of international research networks and peer-reviewed journals with specified foci, such as cultural diversity in music education (*CDIME*²), sociology of music education (*ISSME*³), music analyses, and philosophy of music education (*ISPME*⁴). In several of these research journals and networks, teacher practice and teacher training are focused.

Teacher education in Scandinavian and German contexts has also influenced the larger field of music education and music education research. Building on the German traditions of *Bildung* and *Didaktik*, music was, from the early days, a primary subject and a main activity both in the compulsory school and in general teacher education in Norway (Jørgensen, 2001; Sætre, 2014). *Bildung* (No: *danning/dannelse*, Sv: *bildning*) can be explained as a philosophical approach to education that concerns both personality development and the socialization of humans to responsible and autonomous individuals (see, for example, Danner, 1994). *Didaktik* (different from the English word “didactics”) can be seen as the science of all the factors that affect education in general (Ger: *Allgemeine Didaktik*) as well as in specific subjects (Ger: *Fachdidaktik*) (see, for

1 In Germany, though, *Theaterwissenschaft*, *Literaturwissenschaft*, and *Kunstwissenschaft* have existed for several decades, with professorships and study programs on several universities (e.g., Held & Schneider, 2007; Knudsen, 1950; Weimar, 1989). In Scandinavian countries similar disciplines exist under names as (in Norwegian): *teatervitenskap*, *litteraturvitenskap* and *kunstvitenskap*.

2 Cultural Diversity in Music Education (CDIME).

3 International Symposium on the Sociology of Music Education (ISSME).

4 International Society for the Philosophy of Music Education (ISPME).

example, Seel, 1999). From this, considerable research on music education is provided from general teacher educational perspectives, where pedagogy, didaktik, teaching, and learning are the common references. Today, there exists many kinds of educations in Norway that qualifies candidates to teach music and to conduct music education research. Some of these are hosted by teacher education institutions (for example teacher education for compulsory school and early childhood teacher education) and others by higher music institutions (for example, both performing music educations and musicological educations). This complex scenery of music/teacher education and ongoing discussions about quality, aims, and ways of articulating form an important background for this anthology and for the chapters that stem from many places in this landscape. One main topic in the confronting exchanges between music-oriented and education-oriented higher education contexts includes how new knowledge is developed and how research should be conducted and what it should look like. Artistic research, or arts-based research with its manifold terminology (artistic development, practice-led, arts-oriented, etc., e.g. Leavy, 2017) has developed as an influential path for research both in higher music education and in teacher education, and challenges traditional, scientific research in questioning the emphasis on verbal reflection, methodological considerations, and literature review.

Music Pedagogy Research

Musikpädagogik (Eng: music education, No: musikkpedagogikk) developed as an independent area of education and research in Germany starting in the 1970s;⁵ For example, through important publications, such as Alt's *Didaktik der Musik* (1968) and Abel-Struth's *Grundriss der Musikpädagogik* (1985), which conceptualized and provided a system of terms within the fields of *Musikpädagogik* and *Musikdidaktik*, through the

5 In Germany, also other arts subjects have institutionalized own study programs, professorships and research networks in arts specific pedagogies scientific disciplines such as Theaterpädagogik, Tanzpädagogik and Kunstpädagogik. e. g.: *Die Gesellschaft für Tanzforschung* (established 1986), *Die Zeitschrift für Theaterpädagogik* (established 1985), *IMAGO. Forschungsverbund Kunstpädagogik* (established 2014).

growth of the fields own professorships and study programs in *Musikpädagogik* at German universities, and through a range of networks and journals focusing on *musikpädagogische Forschung* (music education research).⁶ The development of *musikkpedagogikk* and *musikkdidaktikk* as fields of education and research in Scandinavian countries (especially in Denmark and Norway) drew heavily on the German tradition, with Frede V. Niensens influencing work beginning in the mid-1970s (Nielsen, 1974, 1998, 2003; see also Benum, 1978; Ruud, 1979; Varkøy, 2003; Veia & Leren, 1972), while in Sweden also British researchers highly influenced the field's growth (Lindgren et al., 2011). Nielsen has endeavored to introduce and influence the wider field of music education research with a basis of the German traditions of *Bildung* and *Didaktik* as a metalevel about learning and teaching music with extensive work over several decades (Nielsen, 2005, 2006, 2007). Georgii-Hemming and Lilliedahl (2014, p. 134) have explained how they distinguish between the terms “music pedagogy and general pedagogy as the science of (music) education” and “(music) education for the practice of teaching and learning (music)” and have also explained music didactics as “the scientific study of all the factors that affect music education and its content” (see also Kertz-Welzel, 2004 and Ferm Thorgersen et al., 2016 for explanations on music pedagogy from this tradition). A main event in the Nordic area was when Frede V. Nielsen, Bengt Olsson, and Harald Jørgensen in 1992 established the research network *Nordisk nettverk for musikkpedagogisk forskning* (NNMPF)/Nordic Network of Research in Music Education (NNRME), with a yearly conference from 1994, and the annual publication *NNMPF/NNRME Yearbook* from 1995. Today, study programs and scholarly positions in *musikkpedagogikk* exist on all levels at universities in Denmark, Sweden, and Norway.

Considerable effort has been made to translate, contextualize, and develop the German tradition of *Musikpädagogik* and *Musikdidaktik* to and through the English language (e.g., Georgii-Hemming & Lilliedahl, 2014; Ferm Thorgersen et al., 2016; Johansen, 2017; Kertz-Welzel, 2004,

6 For example, *Arbeitskreis Musikpädagogische Forschung* (AMPF; established 1965), *Diskussion Musikpädagogik* (established 1999), *Zeitschrift für Kritische Musikpädagogik* (ZfKM; established 2002), and *Beiträge empirischer Musikpädagogik* (b:em; established 2010).

2014; Nielsen, 2005, 2006; Vogt et al., 2014).⁷ Also, arts educational research within other arts subjects has made an effort to differentiate between the term “education” and the term “pedagogy” (e.g., Enghausser, 2007; Risner, 2008). Our aim, in using the term “music pedagogy” in the title of this anthology, is to emphasize philosophical, theoretical, and critical meta-perspectives that are fundamental to the German and Scandinavian traditions of *Musikpädagogik/musikkpedagogikk* as a widening scope for the discussions in this book. Thus, the diverse chapters concern not only music teaching and learning but also Bildung of humans and societies as such, with concerns articulated about how, where, with whom, from what, and with which intentions such activities happen.

The Anthology’s Three Parts and Fifteen Chapters

The anthology’s chapters are organized by three themes: (i) instrumental music education, (ii) group-oriented and interdisciplinary music education, and (iii) critical examination of music teacher education programs.

Part one comprises six chapters, all focusing on aspects of instrumental music education. The first two chapters concern the assessment of instrumental music performance and the difficulties of articulating and operating quality norms in performance music. In Chapter One, Ragnhild Sandberg-Jurström, Monica Lindgren, and Olle Zandén examine views on the criteria for approval in entrance auditions to Swedish performing music teacher programs and problematize these regarding issues of transparency and broadened recruitment. This chapter is titled, “A Mozart Concert or Three Simple Chords? Limits for Approval in Admission tests for Swedish Specialist Music Teacher Education.” Chapter Two, written by Wenche Waagen, is an inquiry of examiners’ expectations and understanding of quality in assessing music performance

⁷ The term “Music Pedagogy” is also used in a contrary meaning to the German/Scandinavian explanation given here, related to specific disciplines. For example, “popular music pedagogy”, “piano pedagogy”, and “music history pedagogy”. This refers to different traditions than we build on in this introduction and is not elaborated on here.

in student bachelor concerts. This chapter, titled “Vurderingskriterier i utøvende musikk: Et verktøy for pålitelig vurdering av studentenes bachelorkonsert?” [Assessment Criteria in Music Performance: A Tool for Reliable Assessment of the Students’ Bachelor Concert?], is theoretically based on Sadlers’ distinction between analytical and holistic approaches to assessment. The third chapter concerns the way a principal instrument is emphasized in music teacher education and what kind of knowledge this might provide. Fritz Flåmo Eidsvaag and Elin Angelo are the authors of this chapter, titled “The Craftsmanship That Disappeared? Investigating the Role of the Principal Instrument in Music Teacher Education Programs.” In Chapter Four, Robin Rolfhamre uses a philosophical approach to argue that we must give more attention to what, whom, and why we educate, and asks how this affects the teacher’s mandate. This chapter is titled “Can We Buy Virtue? Implications from State University Funding on the Musical Instrument Performance Teacher Mandate.” In the fifth chapter of the anthology, “Facing The Soprano: Uncovering a Feminist Performative ‘I’ Through Autoethnography, Runa Hestad Jenssen elaborates on her own path, as a professional musician, toward becoming a feminist and performative researcher. In the sixth and last chapter in this part, David Scott Hamnes examines pipe organ educational praxis for children in Norway. This chapter is titled “Organ Teaching for Children in Norway: An Educational Field in Development,” and presents a pedagogical contribution to the field of organ education.

The second part concerns group-oriented and interdisciplinary music education and has three chapters. In Chapter Seven, Anne-Lise Heide examines aesthetic learning processes in a multidisciplinary project in teacher education in Norway, including the subject’s music and sports, with a focus on experience, inquiry, and creation. The title of Heide’s chapter is “Bærekraft – lærekraft: Estetiske læringsprosesser gjennom tverrfaglig arbeid i grunnskolelærerutdanningen” [Sustainability Learning. Aesthetic Learning Processes Through Interdisciplinary Work in General Teacher Education]. In the eighth chapter, Roy A. Waade and Anders Dalane examine the subject of performance and concert production at a music teacher education program (*faglærerutdanning i musikk*) in Norway. This chapter is titled “Evaluering av konsertformidling i

høyere utdanning” [Assessing Music Performance in Higher Education] and employs the Danish concept of *Ønskekvistmodellen* [The Wishbone Model] to examine how the students in this subject are supervised and assessed. In Chapter Nine, dilemmas in the education of choir leaders are focused. Dag Jansson and Anne Haugland Balsnes here apply theory on communities of practice and didactical theory, and identify significant dilemmas that appear in higher education that qualify choir leaders. The title of this chapter is “Dilemmaer i skandinavisk korlederutdanning” [Dilemmas in Scandinavian Choral Conducting Education].

In the third part of the anthology, five chapters approach the foundation for music/teacher education through diverse lenses of critical theory. In Chapter Ten, “Woman and Full Professor in Music Education – Work Experiences in the Field of Academia” Carina Borgström Källen examines the work experiences of female full professors in music education through a field-oriented and gender-critical approach. In Chapter Eleven, Sunniva Skjøstad Hovde examines how music teacher educators understand the terms “multi-culturalism” and “whiteness/white privileges” and how this is displayed in their everyday lives as music/teacher educators. The title of this chapter is “Experiences and Perceptions of Multiculturality, Diversity, Whiteness, and White Privilege in Music Teacher Educations in Mid-Norway – How They Might Contribute to Excluding Structures.” Jan Ketil Torgersen and Morten Sæther are the authors of Chapter Twelve, titled “Er jeg musikalsk? Barnehagelærerstudenters oppfatning av egen musikalitet” [Am I Musical? Early Childhood Teacher Students’ Notions of Their Own Musicality]. This chapter is based on a quantitative survey among early childhood teacher students and examines their perception of their own musicality. In Chapter Thirteen, Ben Toscher explores how administrators and educators in higher music education (HME) in Norway define and argue for entrepreneurship as part of HME. This chapter is titled, “Music Teachers’ and Administrators’ Perspectives on Entrepreneurship in Norwegian Higher Music Education: An Exploratory Pilot Study.” The last chapter in the anthology is written by Elin Angelo, Jens Knigge, Morten Sæther, and Wenche Waagen, and examines how music/teacher education is represented on websites at four institutions in Norway. This chapter is

critically and theoretically geared through Foucault's concepts of power/knowledge and governmentality. This fourteenth chapter in the anthology is titled, "The Discursive Terms of Music/Teacher Education at Four Higher Educational Institutions."

Enjoy the book!

References

- Abel-Struth, S. (1985). *Grundriss der Musikpädagogik* [Basic outline of music pedagogy]. Schott.
- Adler, G. (1885). Umfang, Methode und Ziel der Musikwissenschaft [Scope, method, and goal of musicology]. *Vierteljahrschrift für Musikwissenschaft* 1.
- Alt, M. (1968). *Didaktik der Musik: Orientierung am Kunstwerk* [Music didactics: Orientation toward the work of art]. Schwann.
- Bartleet, B.-L., & Higgins, L. (Eds.). (2018). *The Oxford handbook of community music*. Oxford University Press.
- Benum, I. (1978). *Musikkpedagogiske aspekter* [Aspects of music pedagogy]. Norsk musikk Tidsskrift nr 3.
- Blacking, J. (1976). *How musical is man?* Faber & Faber.
- Danner, H. (1994). 'Bildung' A basic term of German education. *Educational Sciences*, (4). https://www.helmut-danner.info/pdfs/German_term_Bildung.pdf
- DeNora, T. (2003). Music sociology: Getting the music into the action. *British Journal of Music Education*, 20(2), 165–177. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0265051703005369>
- Elliot D. J. (1995). *Music Matters: A new philosophy of music education*. Oxford University Press.
- Enghauser, R. (2007). The quest for an ecosomatic approach to dance pedagogy. *Journal of Dance Education*, 7(3), 80–90. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15290824.2007.10387342>
- Ferm Thorgersen, C., Johansen, G., & Juntunen, M.-L. (2016). Music teacher educators' visions of music teacher preparation in Finland, Norway and Sweden. *International Journal of Music Education*, 34(1), 49–63. [10.1177/0255761415584300](https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761415584300)
- Georgii-Hemming, E., & Lilliedahl, J. (2014). Why *what* matter. On the context dimensions of music didactics. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, 22(2), 132–155. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.2979/philmusieducrevi.22.2.132>
- Held, J., & Schneider, N. (2007). *Grundzüge der Kunstwissenschaft* [The main features of art studies]. UTB.

- Johansen, G. (2017). Hva er selvkritisk musikkpedagogikk, og hvordan skal vi forholde oss til den? [What is self-critical music pedagogy, and how can we relate to it?]. In K. Stensæth, G. Trondalen, & Ø. Varkøy (Eds.), *Musikk, handlinger, muligheter. Festskrift til Even Ruud* (pp. 265–278). NMH-publikasjoner.
- Jørgensen, H. (2001). Sang og musikk i grunnskole og lærerutdanning 1945–2000 [Song and music in the compulsory school and in teacher education 1945–2000]. *Studia Musicologica Norvegica*, 27, 103–131.
- Kertz-Welzel, A. (2004). Didaktik of music: A German concept and its comparison to American music pedagogy. *International Journal of Music Education*, 22(3), 277–286.
- Kertz-Welzel, A. (2014). Musikpädagogische Grundbegriffe und die Internationalisierung der *Musikpädagogik*. Ein unlösbares Dilemma? [Basic concepts of music education and the internationalization of music education. An unsolvable dilemma?] In J. Vogt, M. Brenk, & F. Heß (Eds.), (*Grund-)Begriffe musikpädagogischen Nachdenkens. Entstehung, Bedeutung, Gebrauch* (pp. 19–35). LIT.
- Knudsen, H. (1950). *Theaterwissenschaft. Werden und Wertung einer Universitätsdisziplin* [Theater studies: Becoming and evaluation of a university discipline]. Christian-Verlag.
- Leavy, P. (2017). *Handbook of arts-based research*. Guilford Publications.
- Lindgren, M., Frisk, A., Henningsson, I., & Öberg, J. (Eds.) (2011). *Musik och kunskapsbildning. En festskrift till Bengt Olsson* [Music and knowledge formation. A festschrift to Bengt Olsson]. Art Monitor, Göteborg Universitet.
- Nettl, B. (2001). The institutionalization of musicology: Perspectives of a North American ethnomusicologist. In N. Cook & M. Everist (Eds.), *Rethinking music* (pp. 287–310). Oxford University Press.
- Nielsen, F. V. (1974). Hvad er musikpedagogik? [What is music pedagogy?]. *Dansk Musik Tidsskrift*, 48(5), pp. 124–130.
- Nielsen, F. V. (1998). *Almen Musikdidaktik* [General music didactics] (2nd ed.). Christian Ejler.
- Nielsen, F. V. (2003). Didaktik på tværs af fag. Aspekter i fagdidaktikkens kernefaglighed [Didactics on cross of subjects. Aspects in the core of subject didactics]. In M. B. Nielsen, R. Tønnesen, & S. M. Wiland (Eds.), *Fagdidaktikk på offensiven* [Proactive subject didactics] (pp. 12–36). Høyskoleforlaget.
- Nielsen, F. V. (2005). Didactology as a field of theory and research in music education. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, 13(1), 5–19
- Nielsen, F. V. (2006). A view on the future of an international philosophy of music education: A plea for a comparative strategy. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, 14(1), 7–14.

- Nielsen, F. V. (2007). Music (and arts) education from the point of view of Didaktik and Bildung. In L. Bresler (Ed.), *International handbook of research in arts education* (pp. 265–286). Springer.
- Risner, D. (2008) The politics of gender in dance pedagogy. *Journal of Dance Education*, (8)3, 94–97. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15290824.2008.10387364>
- Ruud, E. (1979). *Musikkpedagogisk teori* [Music pedagogical theory]. Norsk musikkforlag.
- Ruud, E. (2016). *Musikkvitenskap* [Musicology]. Cappelen Damm.
- Seel, H. (1999). Allgemeine Didaktik (General Didactics) and Fachdidaktik (Subject Didactics). In B. Hudson, F. Buchberger, P. Kansanen, & H. Seel (Eds.), *Didaktik/Fachdidaktik as science(s) of the teaching profession?* (pp. 13–20). Tintee Publications.
- Small, C. (1998). *Musicking: The meanings of performing and listening*. University Press of New England.
- Sætre, J. H. (2014). *Preparing generalist student teachers to teach music: A mixed-methods study of teacher educators and educational content in generalist teacher education music courses* [Doctoral dissertation, The Norwegian Academy of Music]. <https://nmh.brage.unit.no/nmh-xmlui/handle/11250/226772>
- Varkøy, Ø. (2003). *Musikk – strategi og lykke: bidrag til musikkpedagogisk grunnlagstenkning* [Music – strategy and happiness: Contribution to basic thinking in music pedagogy]. Cappelen akademisk forlag.
- Vea, K., & Leren, O. (1972). *Musikkpedagogisk grunnbok* [Music pedagogy, basic book]. Norsk Musikkforlag.
- Vogt, J., Heß, F., & Brenk, M. (Eds.). (2014). *(Grund-)Begriffe musikpädagogischen Nachdenkens. Entstehung, Bedeutung, Gebrauch [(Basic) concepts of music pedagogical thinking. Development, meaning, application]*. LIT.
- Weimar, W. (1989). *Geschichte der deutschen Literaturwissenschaft bis zum Ende des 19. Jahrhunderts* [History of German literary science until the end of the 19th century]. Fink.
- Wright, R. (Ed.) (2016). *Sociology and music education*. Ashgate.